UNITED STATES DISTRICE EASTERN DISTRICT OF N	NEW YORK		
MARIA PENA,		X	
	Plaintiff,		<u>Discovery Order</u> CV-02-3147 (NG) (JMA)
-against-			
CITY OF NEW YORK, et a	1.,		
	Defendants.	V	
HERRERA, et al.,		Λ	
	Plaintiffs,		<u>Discovery Order</u> CV-02-3163 (NG) (JMA)
-against-			CV-02-3103 (NG) (JMA)
CITY OF NEW YORK, et a	1.,		
	Defendants.	V	
APPEARANCES:		Λ	
Derek Sells The Cochran Firm 233 Broadway, 5 th Floor New York, New York 10279 Attorney for Plaintiff Pena	•		
Alan M. Shapey Lipsig, Shapey, Manus & M 40 Fulton Street, 25 th Floor	overman P.C.		

Alan H. Scheiner
Brian K. Morgan
The City of New York Law Department
Office of Corporation Counsel
100 Church Street
New York, New York 10007
Attorneys for Defendants City of New York,
Thomas Deprisco, Roy Richter, Ricky Karpen,
Brian White, Michael Zarilli, David Gaskin

New York, New York 10038

Attorney for Plaintiffs Herrera et al.

Vincent Fiorenza & Peter Moy

Howard Hogan Mary Jo White Debevoise & Plimpton LLP 919 Third Avenue New York, New York 10022 Attorneys for Defendant PBA

George L. Repetti John Aloysius Beyrer Mulholland, Minion and Roe 374 Hillside Avenue Williston Park, New York 11596 Attorneys for Defendant Joseph Grey

Bruno Vincent Gioffre, Jr.
Andrew C. Quinn
Quinn Ferrante & Mellea, LLP
399 KnollWood Road, Suite 220
White Plains, New York 10603
Attorneys for Defendants Keith Singer
& Dennis Healy

Gregory M. Longworth
John W. Burns
Worth, Longworth & London
111 John Street, Suite 640
New York, New York 11038
Attorneys for Defendants Jack Conway,
Michael Immett, Michael Gaudio,
Anthony Prinzano, Edward Sills,
Marie Desario, Paul Alba, John Chavez,
John Gallo, Michael McGill, Patrick Lynch,
Martin Finkelstein & John Welsh

Howard Finkelstein Law Offices of Howard Finkelstein 364 North Avenue New Rochelle, New York 10801 Attorney for Defendant Wild Wild West Inc.

AZRACK, United States Magistrate Judge:

As requested in Alan H. Scheiner's sealed letter to the Court, dated April 7, 2006, City

defendants may submit a letter brief opposing the production of the submitted sealed materials to

the plaintiffs. The individual defendants may do the same. All submissions should be filed

under seal with the Court no later than April 24, 2006.

SO ORDERED.

Dated: Brooklyn, New York

April 17, 2006

JOAN M. AZRACK

UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

-3-